

# Lower Tail Probabilities and Normal Comparison Inequalities

In Memory of Wenbo V. Li's Contributions

Qi-Man Shao

The Chinese University of Hong Kong

# Lower Tail Probabilities and Normal Comparison Inequalities

*In Memory of Wenbo V. Li's Contributions*

Qi-Man Shao

The Chinese University of Hong Kong

- Lower tail probabilities
  - Non-stationary processes
  - Stationary processes
- Special cases
  - Capture time of Brownian pursuits
  - Random polynomials
- Normal comparison inequalities

# 1. Lower Tail Probabilities

Let  $\{X_t, t \in T\}$  be a real valued Gaussian process indexed by  $T$  with  $\mathbb{E} X_t = 0$ . **Lower tail probability** refers to

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{t \in T} (X_t - X_{t_0}) \leq x\right) \text{ as } x \rightarrow 0, t_0 \in T$$

or

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{t \in T} X_t \leq x\right) \text{ as } |T| \rightarrow \infty$$

## ► Examples:

- (a) Capture time of Brownian pursuits
- (b) Random polynomials

► A general result for non-stationary Gaussian processes

Let  $X = \{X_t, t \in T\}$  be a real valued Gaussian random process indexed by  $T$  with mean zero. Define the  $L^2$ -metric

$$d(s, t) = (\mathbb{E} |X_s - X_t|^2)^{1/2}, \quad s, t \in T.$$

For every  $\varepsilon > 0$  and a subset  $A$  of  $T$ , let  $N(A, \varepsilon)$  denote the minimal number of open balls of radius  $\varepsilon$  for the metric  $d$  that are necessary to cover  $A$ . For  $t \in T$  and  $h > 0$ , let

$$B(t, h) = \{s \in T : d(t, s) \leq h\}$$

and define

$$Q = \sup_{h>0} \sup_{t \in T} \int_0^\infty (\ln N(B(t, h), \varepsilon h))^{1/2} d\varepsilon$$

For  $\theta = 1000(1 + Q)$ , define

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{A}_{-1} &= \{t \in T : d(t, t_0) \leq \theta^{-1}x\}, \\ \mathcal{A}_k &= \{t \in T : \theta^{k-1}x < d(t, t_0) \leq \theta^k x\},\end{aligned}$$

where  $0 \leq k \leq L$ ,  $L = 1 + \lceil \ln_{\theta}(D/x) \rceil$  and  $D = \sup_{t \in T} d(t, t_0)$ .

Let

$$\begin{aligned}N_k(x) &= N(\mathcal{A}_k, \theta^{k-2}x) \text{ for } k = 0, 1, \dots, L \\ N(x) &= 1 + \sum_{0 \leq k \leq L} N_k(x).\end{aligned}$$

## Theorem

(Li and Shao (2004))

(i) Assume that  $Q < \infty$  and

$$\mathbb{E}((X_s - X_{t_0})(X_t - X_{t_0})) \geq 0 \text{ for } s, t \in T$$

Then

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{t \in T} X_t - X_{t_0} \leq x\right) \geq e^{-N(x)}$$

(ii) For  $x > 0$ , let  $s_i \in T$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, M$  be a sequence such that for every  $i$

$$\sum_{j=1}^M |\text{Corr}(X_{s_i} - X_{t_0}, X_{s_j} - X_{t_0})| \leq 5/4$$

and  $d(s_i, t_0) = (\mathbb{E} |X_{s_i} - X_{t_0}|^2)^{1/2} \geq x/2$ . Then

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{t \in T} X_t - X_{t_0} \leq x\right) \leq e^{-M/10}.$$

## Special Cases:

- Let  $\{X(t), t \in [0, 1]^d\}$  be a centered Gaussian process with  $X(0) = 0$  and stationary increments, that is

$$\forall t, s \in [0, 1]^d, \quad \mathbb{E}(X_t - X_s)^2 = \sigma^2(\|t - s\|).$$

If there are  $0 < \alpha \leq \beta < 1$  such that

$$\sigma(h)/h^\alpha \uparrow, \quad \sigma(h)/h^\beta \downarrow$$

Then there exist  $0 < c_1 \leq c_2 < \infty$  such that for  $0 < x < 1/2$

$$-c_2 \ln \frac{1}{x} \leq \ln \mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{t \in [0, 1]^d} X(t) \leq \sigma(x)\right) \leq -c_1 \ln \frac{1}{x}.$$

In particular, for the fractional Levy's Brownian motion  $L_\alpha(t)$  of order  $\alpha$ , i.e.  $L_\alpha(0) = 0$  and

$$\mathbb{E}(L_\alpha(t) - L_\alpha(s))^2 = \|t - s\|^\alpha,$$
$$\ln \mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{t \in [0, 1]^d} L_\alpha(t) \leq x\right) \approx -\ln \frac{1}{x}.$$



- Let  $\{X(t), t \in [0, 1]^d\}$  be a centered Gaussian process with  $X(0) = 0$  and

$$\mathbb{E}(X_t X_s) = \prod_{i=1}^d \frac{1}{2} (\sigma^2(t_i) + \sigma^2(s_i) - \sigma^2(|t_i - s_i|)).$$

If there are  $0 < \alpha \leq \beta < 1$  such that

$$\sigma(h)/h^\alpha \uparrow, \quad \sigma(h)/h^\beta \downarrow$$

Then

$$\ln \mathbb{P} \left( \sup_{t \in [0,1]^d} X(t) \leq \sigma^d(x) \right) \approx -\ln^d \frac{1}{x}.$$

In particular, for d-dimensional fractional Brownian sheet  $B_\alpha(t)$  (i.e.,  $\sigma(h) = h^\alpha$ )

$$\ln \mathbb{P} \left( \sup_{t \in [0,1]^d} B_\alpha(t) \leq x \right) \approx -\ln^d \frac{1}{x}$$

## ► Lower tail probabilities for stationary Gaussian processes

Let  $\{B(t), t \geq 0\}$  be the Brownian motion and  $\{U(t), t \geq 0\}$  be the Ornstein-Uhlenbeck process. It is known that  $\{U(t), t \geq 0\}$  and  $\{B(e^t)/e^{t/2}, t \geq 0\}$  have the same distribution. Moreover

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} B(t) \leq x\right) = \mathbb{P}\left(|B(1)| \leq x\right) \sim (2/\pi)^{1/2} x$$

as  $x \rightarrow 0$  and

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{0 \leq t \leq T} U(t) \leq 0\right) = \exp(-T/2 + o(T))$$

as  $T \rightarrow \infty$ .

Is there a connection between these two types of lower tail probabilities ?

Let  $\{X_t, t \geq 0\}$  be a Gaussian process with  $X_0 = 0$ ,  $\mathbb{E} X_t = 0$ . Assume that

- (A1)  $\mathbb{E} X_s X_t \geq 0$  and  $\mathbb{E} X_t^2 = t^\alpha$  for  $\alpha > 0$ ;
- (A2)  $\{Y_t = X(e^t)/e^{\alpha/2}, t \geq 0\}$  is a stationary Gaussian process;
- (A3)  $\{X_{at}, 0 \leq t \leq 1\}$  and  $\{a^{\alpha/2} X_t, 0 \leq t \leq 1\}$  have the same distribution for each fixed  $a > 0$ .
- (A4)  $\rho(t) := \mathbb{E} Y_t Y_0$  is decreasing and

$$a_{h,\theta}^2 := \inf_{0 < t \leq h} \frac{\rho(\theta t) - \rho(t)}{1 - \rho(t)} > 0$$

for every  $0 < h < \infty$  and  $0 < \theta < 1$

By subadditivity and the Slepian lemma,

$$c_{\alpha,Y} := - \lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{T} \ln \mathbb{P} \left( \sup_{0 \leq t \leq T} Y_t \leq 0 \right) = - \sup_{T > 0} \frac{1}{T} \mathbb{P} \left( \sup_{0 \leq t \leq T} Y_t \leq 0 \right)$$

exists. Next result shows that the constant  $c$  is closely related to the rate of the lower tail probability  $\mathbb{P} \left( \sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} X_t \leq x \right)$ .

- [Li and Shao \(2004\)](#):

Under conditions (A1) – A(4), we have

$$P \left( \sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} X_t \leq x \right) = x^{2c_{\alpha,Y}/\alpha + o(1)}$$

as  $x \rightarrow 0$ .

- [Molchan \(1999\)](#): For fractional Brownian motion  $\{B_\alpha(t), t \geq 0\}$  of order  $\alpha$  ( $0 < \alpha < 1$ )

$$P \left( \sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} B_\alpha(t) \leq x \right) = x^{(1-\alpha)/\alpha + o(1)}$$

and hence  $c_\alpha = 1 - \alpha$ .

► Explicit bounds of lower tail probabilities (Li and Xiao (2013))

Let  $B(t)$  be the Brownian motion.

- For  $0 < \theta < 1$

$$P\left(\sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} (B(t) - \theta B(1)) \leq x\right) \sim \frac{1}{3\theta^2(1-\theta)^2\sqrt{2\pi}}x^3,$$

$$P\left(\sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} (B(t) - \theta t B(1)) \leq x\right) \sim (1-\theta)\sqrt{2/\pi}x$$

and

$$\ln P\left(\sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} B(t) - \int_0^1 B(s)ds \leq x\right) \sim -x^2 c$$

where  $c$  is a specified constant.

## 2. Special cases

### ► Capture time of Brownian pursuits

Let  $B_0, B_1, \dots, B_n$  be independent standard Brownian motions.

Define

$$\tau_n = \inf \left\{ t > 0 : \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} B_k(t) = B_0(t) + 1 \right\}.$$

When is  $\mathbb{E}(\tau_n)$  finite?

Note that for any  $a > 0$ , by Brownian scaling,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{P}(\tau_n > t) &= \mathbb{P}\left( \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} \sup_{0 \leq s \leq t} (B_k(s) - B_0(s)) < 1 \right) \\ &= \mathbb{P}\left( \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} \sup_{0 \leq s \leq 1} (B_k(s) - B_0(s)) < t^{-1/2} \right). \end{aligned}$$

Thus, the estimate is reduced to a lower tail probability problem.

► DeBlassie (1987):

$$\mathbb{P}\{\tau_n > t\} \sim ct^{-\gamma_n} \quad \text{as } t \rightarrow \infty.$$

- Bramson and Griffeath (1991):  $\mathbb{E} \tau_3 = \infty$
- Li and Shao (2001):  $\mathbb{E} \tau_5 < \infty$ .
- Ratzkin and Treibergs (2009):  $\mathbb{E} \tau_4 < \infty$ .

What is the asymptotic behavior of  $\gamma_n$ ?

- Kesten (1992):

$$0 < \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \gamma_n / \ln n \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \gamma_n / \ln n \leq 1/4$$

**Conjecture:**  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \gamma_n / \ln n$  exists.

- Li and Shao (2002):

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \gamma_n / \ln n = 1/4$$



Li and Shao (2002) also consider the capture time of the **fractional Brownian motion pursuit**. Let  $\{B_{k,\alpha}(t); t \geq 0\}$  ( $k = 0, 1, 2, \dots, n$ ) be independent fractional Brownian motions of order  $\alpha \in (0, 1)$ . Put

$$\tau_n := \tau_{n,\alpha} = \inf \left\{ t > 0 : \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} B_{k,\alpha}(t) = B_{0,\alpha}(t) + 1 \right\}.$$

Let

$$X_{k,\alpha}(t) = e^{-t\alpha} B_{k,\alpha}(e^t), \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n$$

and

$$\gamma_{n,\alpha} := - \lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{T} \ln \mathbb{P} \left( \sup_{0 \leq t \leq T} \max_{1 \leq k \leq n} X_{k,\alpha}(t) \leq 0 \right)$$

Li and Shao (2002):

$$\frac{1}{d_\alpha} \leq \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\gamma_{n,\alpha}}{\ln n} \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\gamma_{n,\alpha}}{\ln n} < \infty,$$

where  $d_\alpha = 2 \int_0^\infty (e^{2\alpha x} + e^{-2\alpha x} - (e^x - e^{-x})^{2\alpha}) dx$ .

**Conjecture:**

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\gamma_{n,\alpha}}{\ln n} = \frac{1}{d_\alpha}.$$

- ▶ The probability that a random polynomial has no real root

Dembo, Poonen, Shao and Zeitouni (2002)

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\sum_{i=0}^n Z_i x^i < 0 \forall x \in \mathbb{R}^1\right) = n^{-b+o(1)}$$

where  $n$  is even,  $Z_i$  are i.i.d.  $N(0, 1)$ , and

$$b = -4 \lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{T} \ln \mathbb{P}\left(\sup_{0 \leq t \leq T} X_t \leq 0\right)$$

where  $X_t$  is a centered stationary Gaussian process with

$$\mathbb{E} X_s X_t = \frac{2e^{-|t-s|/2}}{1 + e^{-|t-s|}}$$

- Dembo, Poonen, Shao and Zeitouni (2002):  $0.4 < b < 1.29$ .  
**Simulation:**  $b = 0.76 \pm 0.03$
- Li and Shao (2002):  $0.5 < b < 1$

Let  $\{B(t), t \geq 0\}$  be the Brownian motion and put  $B_0(t) = B(t)$ ,

$$B_m(t) = \int_0^t B_{m-1}(s) ds$$

Li and Shao (2003+)

$$P\left(\sup_{0 \leq t \leq 1} B_m(t) \leq x\right) = x^{r_m + o(1)}$$

and

$$b \leq 2r_m(2m + 1), \quad 2r_m(2m + 1) \rightarrow b$$

Open questions:

- What is the value of  $b$ ?
- If  $\{X_t, t \geq 0\}$  is a differentiable stationary Gaussian process with positive correlation, what is the limit

$$\lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{T} \ln P\left(\sup_{0 \leq t \leq T} X_t \leq 0\right) ?$$

### 3. Comparison Inequalities

Let  $n \geq 2$ , and let  $(\xi_j, 1 \leq j \leq n)$  be standard normal random variables with correlation matrix  $R^1 = (r_{ij}^1)$ , let  $(\eta_j, 1 \leq j \leq n)$  be standard normal random variables with correlation matrix  $R^0 = (r_{ij}^0)$ . Set  $\rho_{ij} = \max(|r_{ij}^1|, |r_{ij}^0|)$ .

**Slepian's Lemma:** If  $r_{ij}^1 \geq r_{ij}^0$ , then

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\xi_j \leq u_j\}\right) \geq \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\eta_j \leq u_j\}\right)$$

## Normal comparison inequality:

- **Berman (1964,1971), Cramer and Leadbetter (1967):**

$$\begin{aligned} & \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\xi_j \leq u_j\}\right) - \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\eta_j \leq u_j\}\right) \\ & \leq \frac{1}{2\pi} \sum_{1 \leq i < j \leq n} (r_{ij}^1 - r_{ij}^0)^+ (1 - \rho_{ij}^2)^{-1/2} \exp\left(-\frac{u_i^2 + u_j^2}{2(1 + \rho_{ij})}\right) \end{aligned}$$

- **Li and Shao (2002):**

$$\begin{aligned} & \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\xi_j \leq u_j\}\right) - \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\eta_j \leq u_j\}\right) \\ & \leq \frac{1}{4} \sum_{1 \leq i < j \leq n} (r_{ij}^1 - r_{ij}^0)^+ \exp\left(-\frac{u_i^2 + u_j^2}{2(1 + \rho_{ij})}\right) \end{aligned}$$

- Li and Shao (2002): If

$$r_{ij}^1 \geq r_{ij}^0 \geq 0 \text{ for all } 1 \leq i, j \leq n$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} & \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\eta_j \leq u_j\}\right) \\ & \leq \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\xi_j \leq u_j\}\right) \leq \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{j=1}^n \{\eta_j \leq u_j\}\right) \\ & \quad \exp\left\{\sum_{1 \leq i < j \leq n} \ln\left(\frac{\pi - 2 \arcsin(r_{ij}^0)}{\pi - 2 \arcsin(r_{ij}^1)}\right) \exp\left(-\frac{(u_i^2 + u_j^2)}{2(1 + r_{ij}^1)}\right)\right\} \end{aligned}$$

for any  $u_i \geq 0, i = 1, 2, \dots, n$  satisfying

$$(r_{ki}^l - r_{ij}^l r_{kj}^l) u_i + (r_{kj}^l - r_{ij}^l r_{ki}^l) u_j \geq 0 \quad (*)$$

for  $l = 0, 1$  and for all  $1 \leq i, j, k \leq n$ .

- **Note:** Condition (\*\*) is satisfied if  $u_i = u \geq 0$ .

## Open questions:

- Does the result remain valid without assuming (\*)? Yan (2009) gave a partial answer.
- Can a sharper bound be obtained?



Thank you!!  
Spaseeba!!!!